# Xenophobia, Radicalism and Hate Crime in France, 2020-2022 


#### Abstract

1. Changes (positive and negative) in the legislation affecting the interests of minorities including migrants in the period under review: - discriminatory legislation affecting minorities; - improvement of anti-discrimination legislation; - legislation to combat Hate crime.


Immigration:

On 15 September 2022, President Emmanuel Macron announced a reform of immigration policy that is now scheduled to be discussed in Parliament in the Fall of 2023. The goal of this reform is to curb illegal immigration by making it easier for French authorities to deport illegal aliens, especially those who have been convicted in court. He also wants to impose thougher conditions of employment and knowledge of the French language to those who are accepted. This reform was announced in the wake of several horrendous crimes whose perpetrator was an alien who had been ordered to be deported and had managed to stay, despite of the court's decision. In 2021, only $5,67 \%$ of deportation orders had come to effect, which means that the remaining $95 \%$ of those ordered to leave the country, in fact stay illegally, sometimes because their native countries, especially those in the Maghreb and West Africa, refuse to accept them ${ }^{1}$. The reform, which will be presented in Parliament by Interior Minister Gérald Darmanin, a Conservative, aims at deporting $100 \%$ of those illegal aliens with a criminal conviction. It also deprives illegal aliens of the minimum medical insurance they were given by the State, and wants to make it harder for families to reunite with a member who is already in France. As a kind of counterpart which is supposed to satisfy the Left, undocumented aliens whose skills meet the needs of the job market ( that is, those jobs for which needs are bigger than supplies) will now stay with a permit ( that is, they will no longer be illegals). The reform was planned to be discussed during the Spring of 2023, but has been postponed because of the demonstrations against the reform of pensions.

With regard to asylum seekers, a report from the Commission nationale consultative des droits de l'homme ( CNCDH ) acknowledges the fact that their number is on the rise since 2010, with 132826 applications in $2019^{2}$ and 131000 in 2022. Applications for asylum come from Afghanistan (17 000); Bangladesh (8 600), Turkey (8500); Georgia (8 100) and République démocratique du Congo (5900). There is a specific situation in the overseas territory of Mayotte in the Indian Ocean, which is located only 60 km from the seashore of the Republic of Comoros. In 2022, more

[^0]than 4000 people arrived in Mayotte from there and applied for asylum ${ }^{3}$. Mayotte, where French legislation fully applies, has a population of 350,000 to $400,000,50 \%$ of which is made of foreigners, and $1 / 3^{\text {rd }}$ of those foreigners were born on the island. In order to limit the right to French citizenship of those people who were born in Mayotte from foreign parents (almost always originating from Comoros), a new legislation was passed in $2018^{4}$. The parents need to prove that they have been residents of Mayotte for 3 months before the birth of their child in order for those children to be eligible for French citizenship. Poverty, crime, drugs and tobacco smuggling make for a very tense situation in Mayotte, especially between undocumented aliens who are living in slums and the native population who chose to stay French in 1974 when the rest of the Comoros chose independence.
At the end of April 2023, the French Minister of the Interior announced the launch of "opération Wuambushu" ( Operation Take-back), a military-like attempt by 1800 policemen to arrest the leaders of local gangs and dismantle illegally-built slums by demolishing them.

Discriminatory Legislation against minorities has not been passed and besides, all the laws drafted by the 89 MPs from the National Rally since they were elected in June 2022 have been rejected by the National Assembly committees ${ }^{5}$. None of them, however, were aimed at discriminating against minorities. A 2021 law pushed by Marine Le Pen with the aim of "fighting Islamic ideologies", but which in fact aimed at curtailing civil liberties of Muslim people who are observant was also rejected before it came to the floor ${ }^{6}$. Therefore, the ban of the hijab in public space and that of ritual slaughter, which is supported by RN and Reconquête, Eric Zemmour's party, has not been voted. This ban would also apply to the Jewish skullcap (which, however, Le Pen does not equate with the hijab ${ }^{7}$ ), the National Rally stills intends to ban the slaughtering of kosher meat on French soil ${ }^{8}$.

## Minorities:

The situation of minorities, especially the level of prejudices against them, has been monitored by CNCDH since 1990. The annual report of this independent body shows that from 1990 to 2022, the acceptance of minorities has increased ${ }^{9}$. The tool used to measure that is called Longitudinal Tolerance Index. It has been calculated every year since it was created in 2008 until 2022 by one of the researchers in theCNCDH team, Vincent Tiberj. It measures the changes in prejudice in a concise way. The closer the index is to 100 , the higher the tolerance level. It provides an overview of yearly changes in the opinions and feelings of the respondents towards minorities. In 2022, the Index reached 68, compared to 66 in 2019 and 54 in 2013. The Index reaches 80 with regard to Black people and $79 \%$ with regard to the Jews. However, the acceptance of minorities varies. The

[^1]one with is the most prejudiced against is the Roma minority: $45 \%$ of those surveyed say the Roma live from thief and $66 \%$ say they are a group living apart from mainstream society. The Jews are seen as being entirely French ( $89 \%$ ) and only $18 \%$ have a negative image of them. Nevertheless, $37 \%$ think that the Jews have a specific relationship with money (that is, they are greedy) and $34 \%$ say the Jews are more committed to Israël than to France ${ }^{10}$. Islam has a negative image among $28 \%$ and a positive one among $31 \%$ of the French, but $38 \%$ think that it is a threat to French national identity. Some religious obligations of Islam are strongly opposed: such is the case of the hijab (50\%). $48 \%$ oppose the fact that Islam bans the graphic representation of Prophet Muhammad.

The high level of the Tolerance Index does not mean that there is no violence directed against minorities. According to statistics from the Ministry of the Interior, in 2021 the Police received 12500 complaints for racist or antisemitic actions or threats, those being equally divided between 6300 serious offenses $(+13 \%$, those end in the offender standing trial) and 6200 less serious offenses $(+26 \% \text {, those are punished with a fine })^{11}$. The Police report contains very precious information about both the victims and the offenders. The Police reports that foreigners from Africa are over-represented among the victims. It also reports that the 2125 offenders who have been indicted for racist or antisemitic actions or threats, those aged above 55 as well as women, are over-represented. Those are rather counter-intuitive findings but as the report states, data is based upon registered complaints only, and upon prosecuted offenders only. As a reminder, over the period 2013-2018, the Police reported that only $25 \%$ of those who suffered physical harm because of a racist attack filed a complaint, and this proportion sunk to $5 \%$ when it came to victims of verbal racist abuse. The Police report also gives interesting figures regarding the category of "attacks against religions": out of 1859 such attacks, 857 targeted Christian (almost always Catholic) buildings or cemetaries, while 589 targeted the Jewish community ( synagogues, community centers and cemetaries) and 213 targeted Islam ${ }^{12}$.

Regarding Antisemitism, a 2021 report from the Security Service of the Jewish Community, whose statistics are cross-checked with the Ministry of the Interior, counted 589 antisemitic acts and threats in 2021, an increase of $75 \%$ over the year 2020. Physical violence increased by $36 \%$ compared to 2020 and one should note Two worrying phenomena deserving particular attention: the high number of antisemitic acts committed in the private sphere ( $25 \%$ of antisemitic acts). These are essentially acts committed near the victim's home, by a neighbour or by people living in the neighbourhood; the growing use of weapons in physical attacks ( $20 \%$ ) and threats ( $10 \%$ ). Knives are the most used weapons ( 9 cases) and pistols ( 5 cases) ${ }^{13}$.

## Law enforcement practices affecting minorities - examples in the period under review:

- discriminatory practices;

[^2]There is an ongoing debate on the topic of violence from law enforcement officers, whether aimed at minorities or at people who do not belong to any minority group. A November 2020 case of violence against a coulored music producer who was beaten and insulted without any purpose ${ }^{14}$ led to a heated debate on this topic, which is especially important because law enforcement officers are supposed to get training (at least, they are supposed to) on how to deal with minority groups, and they are supposed to get courses on Racism and Antisemitism. There are few reliable statistics on this topic, but the internal unit which is in charge of disciplinary inquiries within the Police, the IGPN (Inspection générale de la police nationale), admits that in 2019, about 30 internal inquiries were launched on the suspicion that policemen had acted violently because of a Racist intent. The Défenseur des droits (Civil/Human Rights Defender), an independent personality who is named by the French President and is tasked to monitor and report Human Rights violations, nevertheless reported that in 2013-2018, $80 \%$ of the youth with an Arab or Black African background were given an identity check by the Police, which compares to $16 \%$ in the general population ${ }^{15}$.

- anti-discrimination practices, including government support measures for minorities; Since 2018, the Police publishes a yearly report on violent clashes between Policemen and citizens. In the context of the Yellow Vests demonstrations (2018-2020, still going on with a much lesser intensity), there a surge in internal Police inquiries following such clashes ( 1460 in 2019, $+24 \%$ when compared to 2018). In 2019, 868 complaints were filed against Policemen for alleged misuse of force, that is $+41 \%$ when compared to 2018. Although no data is available as of May 2023, the number of alleged misuse of force during the 2023 demonstrations against the Pensions Law is high, but this misuse of force is not specifically targeted at minority groups. Other anti-discrimination practices involving Government support include the existence of the aforementioned CNCDH, of the DILCRAH ( the delegation against Racism, Antisemitism and anti-LGBT hate, under the supervision of the Prime Minister) and the CIPDR, or Inter-Ministreial Committee for the prevention of hate and radicalization.


## - combating Hate crime:

Combating hate crime is the task of the Office central de lutte contre les crimes contre l'humanité et les crimes de haine (OCLCH), a specialized unit of the Gendarmerie ( therefore, a military unit), which was created in 2013 with the aim of finding, and prosecuting, war criminals and their accomplices who had sought refuge in France ( many of them were under warrant for their participation in the Tutsi genocide in the Rwanda). In 2020, an unit in charge of prosecuting hate speech was created within OCLCH. The unit is staffed by about 10 people and is in charge of prosecuting racist, antisemitic, antireligious and anti-LGBTQI+ propaganda, especialy online. There are two ways the unit can act. Either it is to make an inquiry following a complaint filed on the PHAROS platform ${ }^{16}$ or it is given this task by the public prosecutor's office. The scope of the unit's activity has

[^3]been expanded by a 21 December 2021 decree ${ }^{17}$. Following the unit's inquiry, Holocaustdenier Vincent Reynouard, who had fled France to avoid being jailed, has been located in Scotland and is now in prison, awaiting his extradition trial ${ }^{18} .80 \%$ of the cases the unit deals with are related to the internet and social networks ${ }^{19}$.
$\checkmark$ preventive measures directed against the spread of extremist views in society, against the financing of Terrorism, etc.
$\checkmark$ The financing of terrorism is investigated by Tracfin (Traitement du renseignement et action contre les circuits financiers clandestins), is a service of the French Ministry of Finances, also in charge of investigating money-laundering. Fighting the spread of extremist views is a competence of CIPDR through its "Unité de contre-discours républicain", which is in charge of producing videos and content for social networks, debunking hate speech, exposing radical ideologies and fighting fake-news.
$\checkmark$ criminal proceedings;

In 2020, the Judiciary has 7759 cases of racist crimes involving 6740 individuals, that is a $5 \%$ increase over 2019. After prosecution, only 2858 of them have either stood trial (45\%) or be ordered somekind of a reparation for the harm they have done, often by doing community work. The reason why only 2858 have been face with criminal pursuits is either that the crime was not sufficiently documented and was therefore dropped, or that alternative measures were preferred by the prosecutor. Anyway in 2020, only 955 racist offenders have received a penal sanciton and, although this is $+10 \%$ when compared to 2019, it remains too low. The reason given by the judiciary is that in many cases, the racist intent to harm or threaten is hard to prove ${ }^{20}$.
$\checkmark$ guilty verdicts;

- law enforcement practices as a manifestation of the conflict between democratic values and security interests, if any;
The only problem I See with regard to this topic is the presence of racist and even neo-nazi servicemen in the French Army, which has been documented by many articles in Left-Wing newspapers such as Mediapart ${ }^{21}$ and Stretpress ${ }^{22}$. Although the number of individuals involved is small (about 50 according to Mediapart), the issue is very sensitive because some of those involved serve in the Special Forces and have been sent to fight terrorism in Afghanistan and the Sahel. Media exposure of this issue has led the Ministry of Defence to oust a few of those involved, but this must be done within a legal process that in most cases cannot take place before the Private's contract comes to an end and he wants to renew it,

[^4]in which case the Army can refuse. Terminating a contract for political reasons is quite difficult unless unlawful behavior can be proved.
2. The attitude of the society towards immigrants, foreigners, ethnic, religious and sexual minorities: See above.

- have sociological surveys or other studies been carried out in your country to determine the motivation of public sentiment towards these groups? If yes, what are the results? What, in your opinion, had a decisive influence on the formation of this motivation (the activities of political parties and NGOs, the media, any events in the socio-political and economic spheres, government actions, etc.) without a Pandemic and the war in Ukraine;
The CNCDH report contains a lot of sociological date on this topic. It points to the general context of the standard of living and inflation being the top-priority of the French, including in the middle-class. As a consequance $59 \%$ of the French say they are less well-off than several years ago. The ensuing consequence is that $71 \%$ say one "has to be cautious when dealing with another person" and this is regardless of that person's ethnicity/religion.
- how the general attitude of society towards immigrants, foreigners, other minorities has changed;
- describe negative social manifestations in relation to immigrants, foreigners, ethnic, religious and sexual minorities, give examples;
- radical manifestations by minorities groups towards the majority of the population, if any. What are the reasons for these manifestations in your opinion?

4. COVID -19 Pandemic and its impact on the level of Xenophobia and the Radicalization of the Society.

After the pandemic started in February 2020, several personalities on the Far-Right pointed to the possible responsibility of the Chinese government in a belated and inappropriate response to the pandemic but also with the idea that the virus has escaped accidentally from the Wuhan virology laboratory. This theory was propagated in mid-April 2020 in France by Professor Luc Montagnier, 2008 Nobel Prize in Medicine, and was abundantly commented by elected representatives of the National Rally such as Julien Odoul and MP Gilbert Collard, as by the former MEP Jean-Yves Le Gallou, from the New Right Polemia Foundation. They did not say the Chinese had released the virus on purpose, but expressed doubts about the version that the virus came from contaminated food and was exported by people who had traveled from China to Europe. They supported Montagnier's claim as being a credible alternative to the "official truth" stated by the WHO and the European governments. The National Rally officially did not fully follow in the footsteps of Montagnier, and it is certain that Marine Le Pen took great care not to harm her "normalization" by being called a Conspirationist. So National Rally MEP Annika Bruna called for the creation of an international commission of inquiry into the origins of the pandemic, asking that China give this commission access to its territory. Notwhistanding this quite moderate attitude of NR, anti-Chinese Racism rapidly became viral on social
media, leading to a judiciary inquiry in November $2020^{23}$ but also to a rise of Racism awareness among the Chinese community in France and the emergence of a counternarrative, demonstrations and activity on social media by French-Chinese citizens ${ }^{24}$. The Chinese community is not the only one who has been blamed for the pandemic, however: Jews were also targeted. It happens that the then-Minister for Health, Agnès Buzyn, her husband, Prof. Yves Lévy and the Government Coordinator of the COVID task-force, Prof. Jérôme Salomon, are Jewish and are widely respected physicians. When one of their colleagues in Marseille, Prof. Didier Raoult ( who is not politically committed) , challenged the Government's anti-COVID policy by asking Chloroquine to be used as a cure, and used it himself in his hospital against the Government's advice, he got a tremendous media coverage and became a very popular figure among Conspirationists, who believed his efforts were sabotaged by a "Jewish lobby" within the medical sector ${ }^{25}$. This belief, which is strong among the followers of Alain Soral's Egalité et Réconciliation movement ${ }^{26}$, is shared by the Catholic Fundamentalist political party, Civitas. On 7 August 2021 in Metz, during a demonstration against COVID restrictions, a former National Rally member named Cassandre Fristot, a teacher, held an antisemitic poster which clearly targeted Jewish politicians, businessmen and philanthropists as the perpetrators of a conspiracy either to spread the virus or at least to hide "the truth" about it ${ }^{27}$. Fristot marched alongside with local militants of Civitas and later became a party member with leadership responsabilities. Civitas took advantage of the pandemic to spread the idea that the virus was part of a worldwide plot by the globalized elites, known as "the Great Reset" ${ }^{28}$. "The Great Reset" is the title of a 2020 book by Klaus Schwab, founder of the Davos World Economic Forum, and his number two man, Thierry Malleret. They urge world leaders to take advantage of the pandemic in order to adopt a new code of conduct aiming at a more inclusive, environment-friendly and innovative world, starting from the idea that big changes in the history of humanity always took place in times of deep, global challenges which disrupt the international order. Conspirationists have read the book in an opposite way, and think it is a blueprint for enslavement of the citizens through vaccination and other new technologies, with Civitas claiming that it will bring Totalitarianism ${ }^{29}$.

In terms of Radicalization, there are social scientists who think that the COVID restrictions have boosted the leaning of many individuals to believe in fancy Conspiracy theories because they believe in their intuitive feelings rather than in science-supported truths ${ }^{30}$.

[^5]Spending many hours on the internet and social networks than they usually did, because the restrictions confined them at home, those individuals have been exposed to a lot of fake news, misinformation and conspiracy theories. It is debated whether such exposure can lead to terrorist actions, but several individuals who were active on social networks before and during the pandemic have been convicted for planning terror actions. Such is the case of former Army recruit Aurélien Chapeau, who was sentenced to 9 years in jail ${ }^{31}$. Official sources say 21 Far-Right militants have been arrested in 2021 for preparing terrorist actions and the Ministry of the Interior confirms the Far-Right is a growing threat ${ }^{32}$, although it is not clear whether this surge is an outcome of isolation during COVID restrictions.

## 5. Armed conflict in Ukraine and its impact on the level of Xenophobia, Legislation and Law enforcement practice of the country, on the activities of radical groups.

There is no significant impact of the armed conflict in Ukraine in the sense that there is no rise in either anti-Ukrainian or anti-Russian xenophobia. France has hosted 109,000 Ukrainian refugees since the conflict began ${ }^{33}, 10,000$ of whom returned to Ukraine or emigrated to another country. Ukrainian citizens may apply for the status of refugee under the same conditions as any other foreigner. Those who did not apply, that is 65,833 persons, have been granted a "temporary protection status" which exists in the regulations of the European Union ${ }^{34}$. Sanctions imposed by the EU upon Russian interest target individuals with close links to the Russian State, State-owned companies and several media, such as RT France and Sputnik in French, which were suspended on the internet and cable TV in March $2022^{35}$. As a result, those politicians and essayists from the Far-Right who were regularly on the air on either Russia Today in French or the Sputnik website in French have lost a tribune. Far-Right groups, however, can still voice their support for Russia in the conflict with Ukraine, and still travel to Donbas, Crimea of Kherson as "international observers" of the annexation referendums there ${ }^{36}$. Although it is "highly unadvisable to travel to Russia and Ukraine ${ }^{37}$, it is not illegal.

Contrary to a widely held opinion, not all Far-Right activists look to Russia as a model, and some have taken the side of Ukraine since February 2022. They are closely monitored by the Secret Services and two of them who recently returned got a prison sentence for illegal possession of weapons ${ }^{38}$.
${ }^{31}$ Aurélien Chapeau, militant radical de l'ultradroite, condamné à neuf ans de prison ferme (lemonde.fr)
${ }^{32}$ En France, une menace terroriste d'extrême droite en nette progression (france24.com),
${ }^{33}$ Le nombre de réfugiés ukrainiens venu s'installer en France s'est stabilisé (lepoint.fr)
${ }^{34}$ Sanctions contre la Russie et la Biélorussie - Ministère de l'Europe et des Affaires étrangères (diplomatie.gouv.fr)
${ }^{35}$ La chaîne d'information russe RT France annonce sa « fermeture » (lemonde.fr)
${ }^{3636}$ See the case of André Chanclu, leader of the Comité France-Russie and Comité France-Donbass :
https://www.francetvinfo.fr/monde/europe/manifestations-en-ukraine/guerre-en-ukraine-un-militant-francais-d-extreme-droite-parmi-les-etrangers-qui-observent-les-referendums-d-annexion 5378806.htm. Other Far-Right individsuals such as Eamanuel Leroy and Yvan Benedetti also traveled to Donbas in 2022, see : L’extrême droite française offre sa caution aux référendums russes en Ukraine - Libération (liberation.fr)
${ }^{37}$ Ukraine - Ministère de l'Europe et des Affaires étrangères (diplomatie.gouv.fr),

In 2020, the Asgardsrei festival in Kyiv, featuring both MMA and NSBM music, was attended by the Les Zouaves leader. 82 The reason for this link with the Ukrainian XRW is ideological: across Europe, a segment of the XRW is fascinated with the quest for independence that Ukraine pursued against the former USSR.

## 6. Activities of radical groups. Radical Right groups and parties:

## - the emergence of new neo-Nazi and nationalist groups, movements, political parties and groups

In 2020-2023, four Radical Right movements were banned on the ground of Article L.2012-1 of the Internal Security Code, which means they were considered a threat to national security, or were trying to challenge the values of the Constitution, or were seen as disseminating Hate speech. Those groups are either active locally (Les Zouaves in Paris; L'Alvarium in Angers; Bordeaux nationaliste in Bordeaux) or nationally ( Génération Identitaire, banned in 2021, was certainly the most potent group on the Radical Right, with around 800-1,000 followers). Those groups have resumed their activity under another name. During the fall of 2022, Les Zouaves, a Neo-Nazi group of street fighters, became GUD-Paris, under the leadership of Marc de Cacqueray-Valménier ${ }^{39}$. L'Alvarium, whose ideology is a mix of national-revolutionary ideas akin to those of the Italian CasaPound, and Catholic Fundamentalism, is back under the name Rassemblement des étudiants de droite (RED) and still meets at the premises it rented before the ban ${ }^{40}$. Bordeaux nationaliste, a neo-Fascist group, continues under the name «La Bastide bordelaise» ${ }^{41}$. Génération identitaire is now active under the name Argos France ${ }^{42}$. Although the bans are a political signal that the Government cares to closely monitor the Extrerme-Right, this proves that they are not an efficient mean of suppressing Extremist activity. Judiciary action, on the other hand, is far more repressive but comes only as an answer to the activity of groups whose terrorist attempts have been thwarted by the intelligence community. Nine such plots have been unfolded since $2017^{43}$. The Authors were either informal groups of activists or individuals, some of them claiming to follow the Accelerationnist ideology ${ }^{44}$. It is significant that several of the cases were prosecuted by the Parquet national anti-terroriste (PNAT), who so far devoted its activity almost exclusively to Radical Islam ${ }^{45}$.
${ }^{39}$ Des militants d'extrême droite réactivent le GUD à Paris - Libération (liberation.fr)
${ }^{40}$ Angers: l'Alvarium renaît de ses cendres (unioncommunistelibertaire.org)
${ }^{41}$ Extrême droite : «Bordeaux nationaliste» dissous, mais déjà reconstitué - Libération (liberation.fr)
${ }^{42}$ Argos France, les héritiers de Génération identitaire | StreetPress
${ }^{43}$ ttps://www.francetvinfo.fr/politique/menace-terroriste-une-presence-policiere-devant-chacun-des-lieux-de-culte-pour-les-fetes-de-noel-annonce-gerald-darmanin_5543634.html
${ }^{44}$ Deux militants d'ultradroite appelant à des «actions violentes» arrêtés en possession d'armes - Libération (liberation.fr)
${ }^{45}$ Ultradroite : les projets du groupuscule les Barjols détaillés par le Parquet national antiterroriste (lemonde.fr)

As shown by a map of the Far-Right coming from the Antifascist network, La Horde ${ }^{46}$, there is a growing number of local groups which are offshoots of the banned movements, as well as new influencers on social media whose ideology is that of the banned movements. Local groups however, come and go. The only political party that is new on the map is Eric Zemour's Reconquête, launched in January 2022 in order to support his candidacy to the Presidency of France. He polled 7\% and the party has two seats in the Senate, none in the Lower Chamber, and four in the European Parliament, all of them having left Rassemblement national. Reconquête is a conservative and nationalist party with an Identitarian ideology. It stands against the EU, Immigration and Islam. Although it is neither Fascist nor Antisemitic, it is supported by former leaders of Génération identitaire as well as by leaders of the very radical Parti de la France ${ }^{47}$.

## - the main events of the far right in 2020-22;

The Far-Right was heavily impacted in its activities by the restrictions on demonstrations and conferences during the COVID pandemic. In 2021 and until spring 2022, Florian Philippot, leader of Les Patriotes and former number two man in Front national, was at the forefront of demonstrations against COVID-related restrictions ${ }^{48}$, trying to push conspiracy theories about the vaccine being part of an Orwellian scheme of enslaving society and suppressing civil liberties, and suggesting that the pandemic was no more than a flu. His goal was to take advantage of the demonstrations in order to contest the Presidential election, but he miserably failed to get the necessary endorsement from 500 elected officials: in fact, he got only one. The pandemic had the consequence of boosting the audience of Far-Right minded conspiracy theorists who are mostly active on social networks and who, during 2020-2022, either challenged the reality of the pandemic, or suggested the use of alternative medecines to eradicate the virus, or criticized the Government for its mishandling of the pandemic and the alleged subordination of several Cabinet members to "Big Pharma". Such conspirationists include Alexandra HenrionCaude, a Catholic Fundamentalist; Pierre Cassen's Islamophobic website Riposte laïque, the Catholic Fundamentalist group Civitas, etc... ${ }^{49}$

Regardless of that, the Far-Right continued to be involved in street fighting against the Left and Antifascists. The best-know of those groups is "'Les Zouaves" ${ }^{50}$, which was banned on 5 January 2022, following its involvement in a violent action against activists from SOS-Racisme who had came to Zemmour's inaugural election campaign rally to peacefully protest his anti-immigrant rhetoric ${ }^{51}$ ( on 5 December, 2021). Apart from that, the activities of the Far-Right are usually very much similar every year and most actions are commemorations. The main commemorations are:
${ }^{46}$ Schéma de l'extrême droite (màj 12.2022) - La Horde (samizdat.net)
${ }^{47}$ Party's website : Le Parti de la France - La Droite Nationale au service de la France. (parti-de-la-france.fr)
${ }^{48}$ Mouvement anti-pass sanitaire : le pari de Florian Philippot, qui veut profiter de la discrétion du RN
(francetvinfo.fr)
${ }^{49}$ A comprehensive interactive map of such activity, drawn by the investigative team of Conspiracy Watch, a highly knwledgeable source, is available at : Coronavirus : un complotisme pandémique - Google My Maps
${ }^{50}$ Les «Zouaves», nouveaux petits soldats de l'extrême droite radicale - Libération (liberation.fr)
${ }^{51}$ Dissolution du groupuscule d'ultradroite les Zouaves Paris - L'Express (lexpress.fr)

- 7 January, Paris: Memorial tribute to Sainte Geneviève, patroness saint of Paris. Organizer: Paris Fierté, an offshoot of Génération identitaire. Attendance: 500
- 21 January, Paris and various cities: memorial tribute to King Louis XVI on the day of his beheading. Organizer: Action française. Attendance: around 500 in Paris
- 6 February, Paris: memorial tribute to Collaborationnist Robert Brasillach on the day of his execution. Organizer: Les Nationalistes, a neo-Fascist group led by Yvan Benedetti. Attendance: 50.
- April, Paris: annual conference of Institut Iliade, a New Right/Identitarian think-tank ${ }^{52}$. Attendance: 1,000 fee-paying attendees.
- Between 1 and 12 May, Paris: memorial tributes to Joan of Arc on her national festival day. Organizers: Civitas; Action française; Parti de la France. Each marches separately. Attendance: several hundred altogether.
- how the influence of neo-Nazis and radical nationalists on civil society, local and central legislative / executive authorities has changed over the period;

Neo-Nazis proper are very few. Over the period, the media have reported about them on two occasions: because about 30 of them are believed to fight in the Ukraine as volunteers ${ }^{53}$ and because some of them have been involved in a revival of Far-Right soccer hooliganism. The number of French volunteers in the Ukraine who belong to the Far-Right is low, when compared to a total of 400 who have enlisted, at some point, since February 2022. A lot of media attention has been given to those people and the Internal Security Service (DGSI) as well as the Military Intelligence (DRSD) monitor them very closely. The revival of Far-Right, and quite often NeoNazi hooliganism has been acknowledged in 2022 by the main sports daily, L'Equipe ${ }^{54}$. It has come to the forefront in the media during the 2022 World Cup when several groups, including the then already banned Les Zouaves, tried to disrupt fan zones and attack foreigners, especially after the France-Maroc play. Incidents took place in Paris, Lyon, Montpellier, Nice and Strasbourg ${ }^{55}$ and several men have been convicted ${ }^{56}$.

## 7. Activities of radical groups. Islamists.

- the emergence of new Islamist parties and groups (brief description); No new such group is reported.
- the main activities of the Islamists in 2020-22;

The main concern of the authorities is the continued activity of Salafi groups and mosques, as well as the more sophisticated, more intellectual influence of the Muslim Brotherhood. According to the Minister of the Interior, 41 terrorist plots from Islamist Radicals have been unfolded since $2017^{57}$. According to the same

[^6]source, following the vote in 2021 of a Law against "Separatism", aimed at countering Islamic practices that go against the law, 7 islamist associations were banned, 800 Islamist Radicals were deported and 55, 9 million euros were seized on the accounts of Islamic associations (frozen assets or unpaid taxes) ${ }^{58}$. This action of Interior Minister Gérald Darmanin followed the assassination of Samuel Paty, a secondary school teacher who, on 16 October 2020 was beheaded by Chechen Islamist Abdoullakh Abouyezidovich Anzorov, an 18-year-old Russian Muslim refugee.

## - how has the influence of Islamists changed over the period on Muslims in your

 country, as well as on local and central legislative/executive authorities;The beheading of Samuel Paty marked a turning point in government policy against Islamic Radicals in the sense of a more repressive approach to mosques, preachers and associations whose strict adherence to Sunni Orthodox practice is interpreted as a threat to the security of the State. The reason for that is certainly that the murder took place outside of the school where Paty taught, and that he was targeted because a group of pupils had falsely accused him of blasphemy. As public school is seen as the most important pillar of French Secularism and Republican values, the action a big shock. Also, other attacks took place during those years. In 2020, 6 terrorist actions from Islamist killed a total of 7 individuals, one of them in a Catholic church in Nice. In 2021 there was one killing, of a woman police officer, just outside the police station in Rambouillet. In 2022, inside the prison of Arles, an islamic terrorist inmate from Gabon, Africa, killed the well-known Corsica independentist leader Yvan Colonna. Those actions put pressure on the whole Muslim community. However, it is impossible to deny that Radical Islam is a threat and despite statements from the Muslim organizations that they do not condone Radicalism, the number of mosques, prayer rooms, illigal religious schools and other places which were shut by the authorities because of their proselytizing amounted to a total of 718 during the period 2018 to $2022^{59}$.

## 8. Activities of radical groups. Radical left groups and parties:

- the emergence of new ultra-left parties and groups (brief description);

Since the start of the demonstrations against the policies of the Government on the issue of Labor legislation (2016), during the Yellow Vests movement (2019-2020), during the protests against the Pensions reform (2022-23) as well as on several Labor Days, the so-called Black Blocs, a group of black-clad and often masked Anarchist protesters, regularly clash with the police. Since 2018, a surge in Radical Left activity is also seen in connection with environmental issues, with activists settling in areas where the authorities plan to build a motorway, an airport or other projects they think is detrimental to the environment. Those are called ZAD in

[^7]French, meaning "Zones à défendre" (Areas to be defended). The tactic of the Anarchists and Radical Environmentalists who defy the authorities there is to occupy the land until the police needs to use force in order to expel them. A list of such ZADs can be found here ${ }^{60}$. For the first time since the 1980s, the threat of violent activism from the Radical Left prompted the Government to ban, in 2022 the Antifascist Groupe antifasciste Lyon et environs (GALE), the Pro-Palestine Radical Left Collectif Palestine vaincra and the Bloc Lorrain. The ban on the ban of the latter was confirmed in court, the others are now suspended and awaiting judgement. Although the Minister of the Interior announced that he wanted to ban the Radical Left magazine Nantes révolté ( also in 2022), no action followed. A similar action was to take place against the Radical Environmentalist NGO, Les soulèvements de la terre. It was announced in May 2023 but no action is taken so far ${ }^{61}$.
9. Hate crime (statistics and summaries), law enforcement actions, criminal cases, racist attacks, violence and terror over the period (data from government agencies and NGOs): See above

## - vandalism in cemeteries, attacks on religious buildings;

There is a specific problem with vandalizing of jewish cemetaries in the region of Alsace, where such burial places exist in small towns and villages where no Jews live anymore, which means that those places are seldom visited and have no janitor. On 19 February 2019, 100 graves were desecrated in Qatzenheim, near Strasbourg. Two months before on 11 December 2018, the one in Herrlisheim, was desecrated ( 37 jewish graves and the Memorial to the victims of the Shoah). On 3 December 2019, 107 graves were desecrated in Westhoffen. In every case, swastikas and other nazi symbols were painted on the graves. Despite the local police having set up a special taskforce to deal with such desecrations, the perpetrators have not been found so far. The last desecration was on 17 May 2023 in Toulouse, where 4 Christian graves and 2 Jewish graves were desecrated, but no specific symbol was painted by the authors, who were not found. This brings us to the topic of antiChristian desecrations, which is a seldom researched topic. On 7 January 2022, Conservative Senator Valérie Boyer asked the Government to deliver a comprehensive survey of those desecrations, burnings, vandalizing and theft of religious artefacts, whether they hit Christian, Muslim or Jewish places of worship or cemetaries ${ }^{62}$. According to her, 686 anti-Christian actions were recorded in 2021 against 921 in 2019 (for anti-Muslim and anti-Jewish actions, see above), but she rightfully emphasized that according to French legislation, and even tough the Ministry of the Interior releases figures about anti-religious actions, they all fall within the broader category of racist actions, so that especially, those actions targeting the majoritary Christian population is not "racist""3.

## - interethnic clashes;

${ }^{60}$ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zone_to_Defend
${ }^{61}$ https://www.liberation.fr/societe/police-justice/dissolution-des-soulevements-de-la-terre-simple-retard-ou-vrai-recul-20230501_XXJ6UFTRTFA5VLSCOXQXYHMNAE/
${ }^{62}$ https://www.senat.fr/leg/exposes-des-motifs/ppr21-330-expose.html
${ }^{63}$ According to the Government-backed Observatoire du Patrimoine Religieux, $95 \%$ of the religious place in France are Roman Catholic

The notion of "interethnic clashes" is not used in France, because ethnic groups and ethnic minorities are not recognized by law and by the Constitution. The notion of ethnic violence is used by the Extreme-Right, however, to support the claim that immigration brings violence and crime, that the multicultural society will bring chaos and that the so-called Great Replacement (Grand Remplacement) ${ }^{64}$ of the ethnic French by immigrants will bring the country to "Francocide", a neologism coined in 2022 by Eric Zemmour in order to describe the crimes against native French people which are, according to him, motivated by anti-French/anti-Christian hate ${ }^{65}$.

## - cases of violence on racial, ethnic, religious grounds, attacks on human rights activists and anti-fascists;

for cases regarding all categories, see above. With regard to attacks on human rights activists and anti-Fascist, the most serious one was perpetrated in October 2018 by members of the now banned Génération identitaire against the Marseille office of the NGO SOS-Méditerranée, whose action consists in patrolling the Mediterranean with its ocean Viking boat and rescuing migrants who are in danger of drowning ${ }^{66}$. The 23 assaulters were sentenced in 2022 and received suspended jail terms, with one getting a non-suspended year sentence. Cases of intimidation targeting physicians and other health professionals who stood for compulsory vaccination against COVID were many and included death threats, coming from anti-vax conspiracy theorists, including some physicians ${ }^{67}$. Hate
and threats against Antifascist activists, who often belong to the Far-Left, have become more frequent. Several Extreme-Right groups such as the now banned Les Zouaves and the Groupe Union Défense (GUD), led by pro-Pravyi Sektor activist Marc de Caqueray, have an habit of attacking antifascists and the places where they meet ${ }^{68}$. On 5 January 2022, during the launch meeting of Zemmour's presidential bid, the Zouaves attacked militants from the SOS-Racisme NGO who had come to protest against the antiimmigration, anti-Islam rants of Zemmour. Antifascists from the Action antifasciste ParisBanlieue (AFA) and the Anarchist Confédération nationale du travail (CNT) are specifically targeted. What is new is that, like in the United States, some politicians now equate the Extreme-Right and the Antifascists and campaign for a ban on both. On 18 december 2022, Marine Le Pen asked the Governement to ban "all extremist groups", from both sides, in a tactical move to distance her party from neo-Fascists and neo-Nazis ${ }^{69}$. On 30 november 2021 the now leader of the Conservative opposition, Eric Ciotti, who was then campaigning for party leadership, even asked for a ban "on the Antifas" ${ }^{70}$ without even bothering to also name the extreme-Right as another kind of a threat. It looks like

[^8]militants from Zemmour's party are now either out of control from the party leaders or are given a "go" to intimidate antifascist activists ${ }^{71}$, in a way that is very similar to that of the Front national in the years of Jean-Marie Le Pen that is, Reconquête does not throw out those militants from the lunatic fringe of the Extreme-Right who ant to join or attend meetings.

## — hate killings;

"Hate crime" is a category which does not exist per se in France. However, French legislation does take into consideration hate, whether on the ground of race, religion or sexual orientation, as an aggravating factor of a crime, so that the Penal Code asks for harsher sentences when hate motives are found. For harsher sentences on the ground of sexual orientation, see the 31 January $2022 \mathrm{law}^{72}$ and for othr hate crimes, the Law passed on 9 March $2004^{73}$.

## - terrorist attacks based on radical nationalism and religious fanaticism. See above.

The recent attack with a knife on 4 children and 2 elderly people which took place in Annecy on 8 June 2023, is an important event, although at the time of writing, the victims who were injured (including one under 2 y.o) are expected to recover. The new pattern here is that the perpetrator is a Christian refugee from Syria who claimed to act "in the name of Jesus-Christ". ${ }^{74}$ At the time of writing, little is known about the man, Abdalmasih H., born 1991, had left Syria in 2011 and obtained asylum in Sweden ${ }^{75}$, which he left about 7 months ago, leaving behind his Syrian-born wife and a son.

## 10. Conclusions for the period

The policy of the Government with regard to civil liberties is challenged by those NGOs from the Left who think the ban on associations, whatever their ideology is, infringes on the right of citizens to protest and even challenge the fundamental values of the Constitution, as long as they do not engage in terrorist activities or try to overthrow the State. The recent (May 2023) announcement by Minister Darmanin that he wants to ban all public demonstrations by Far-Right groups, and his attempted crackdown on Far-Left associations whose members clashed with the Police are a real legal challenge for the State and it seems very unlikely that such a general ban can be enforced, both from a legal point of view and from a strictly down-to-earth approach. The level of violence between protesters and the police has also reached a turning point, and all eyes are on the forthcoming Paris Olympic Games of 2024, the security of which must be ensured, given

[^9]that protesters from the Radical Left, Radical Environmentalist groups and Islamic terrorists are very likely to at least try to disrupt the event or stage attacks on it. Overall, the level of conflict between protesters and the police is very worrying, and the attitude of some individuals within the police force needs to be investigated for excessive use of force, if one wants to rebuild trust between the police and citizens. Another recommendation is to avoid trying to enforce general bans on Radical groups unless they engage in terrorism, as this may lead to those groups becoming more violent and going underground.

## 11. Recommendations:

- General recommendations for adjusting the legislative framework The legislative framework against Racism is sufficient and as of Summer 2023, there is fear that the forthcoming law on immigration and asylum which will be presented by the Government will walk in the steps of the Danish legislation, going far beyond the adjustements that need to be made to the present legislation. In the context of the campaign for the 2024 election to the European Parliament, and with Marine Le Pen being a real threat to mainstream parties in 2027, our concern is that those parties will try to outdo Rassemblement national by proposing a very restrictive approach to immigration and becoming more vocal in their rebuttal of the multicultural society.

General recommendations for executive authorities in the field of law enforcement, ensuring public safety and observance of human rights. The main issue here, and it can be achieved without any new legislation, is rebuilding trust and confidence between the population, especially members of the minority groups, and the Police. Those who are recruited in the Police are trained, since Police school, in behaving respectuously with any citizen and even any suspect. They are also trained in using coercition in a way that is proportional to the situation they face that is, not to make an excessive use of force, much less of their weapons, unless they feel that their life is at stake and they have no other option other than to fire. However since the Yellow Vests protest began and reached an unprecedented level of violence on both sides, the trust in the Police is low. It is true that the level of violence used by the Black Blocs and some environmentalist activists is high, but the unwise and unnecessary use of sting-ball grenades, GLI-F4 instant tear gas grenades and sometimes, the random physical violence against peaceful demonstrators, are proof that there need to be better training and also disciplinary sanctions against those in the Police force whose behavior is a stain on the whole law enforcement community.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Immigration : Macron veut «durcir » les règles pour les étrangers « les plus dangereux » (lemonde.fr)
    ${ }^{2}$ See : Les Droits de l'Homme en France 2017-2021 - Regards portés par les instances internationales (cncdh.fr)

[^1]:    ${ }^{3}$ See : Les premières données de l'asile 2022 à l'Ofpra sont disponibles [Chiffres provisoires] | Ofpra
    ${ }^{4}$ Mayotte : quatre dates-clés pour comprendre les tensions migratoires sur l'archipel (lemonde.fr)
    ${ }^{5}$ Niche parlementaire du Rassemblement national : les propositions de loi du RN rejetées par les commissions de l'Assemblée | LCP - Assemblée nationale
    ${ }^{6}$ See the draft of the Law : Proposition de loi $n^{\circ} 3844$ visant à combattre les idéologies islamistes (assembleenationale.fr)
    ${ }^{7}$ Le Pen's reasoning is that, anyway, Islamist pressure is so high on the Jews that they cannot wear a kippa on the streets, which is absolutely untrue. See : Marine Le Pen voudrait interdire le voile et la kippa dans l'espace public Reforme
    ${ }^{8}$ Présidentielle 2022 : cette mesure de Le Pen qui signifierait l'interdiction du halal et du casher ( $r$ tl.fr)
    ${ }^{9}$ The Essential of the 2021 report on the fight against racism, antisemitism and xenophobia (cncdh.fr)

[^2]:    ${ }^{10}$ All data included in the 2021 annual Report of the CNCDH : La lutte contre le rasicme, l'antisémitisme et la xénophobie - Année 2021 (cncdh.fr)
    ${ }^{11}$ Actes racistes et antireligieux : des chiffres en hausse en 2021 vie-publique.fr
    ${ }^{12}$ Les actes antireligieux en France | vie-publique.fr
    ${ }^{13}$ 2021-EN (antisemitisme.fr)

[^3]:    ${ }^{14}$ La police française est gangrenée par les fléaux du racisme et de la violence - Libération (liberation.fr)
    ${ }^{15}$ See: Ce que disent les études parues en France sur les contrôles au faciès et les "violences policières" (radiofrance.fr)The Police is entitled to check the identity of anyone who walks or stands in the public domain, even if no offense has been committed.
    ${ }^{16}$ Signaler un contenu suspect ou illicite avec PHAROS / Archives de la rubrique Ma sécurité / Archives - Ministère de l'Intérieur (interieur.gouv.fr)

[^4]:    ${ }^{17}$ Décret $n^{\circ}$ 2021-1738 du 21 décembre 2021 portant modification du décret $\mathrm{n}^{\circ}$ 2013-987 du 5 novembre 2013 portant création d'un office central de lutte contre les crimes contre l'humanité, les génocides et les crimes de guerre - Légifrance (legifrance.gouv.fr)
    ${ }^{18}$ Le négationniste Vincent Reynouard arrêté en Écosse après deux ans de cavale (marianne.net)
    ${ }^{19}$ La haine en ligne, cheval de bataille de l'OCLCH - Gendinfo (interieur.gouv.fr)
    ${ }^{20}$ La lutte contre le rasicme, l'antisémitisme et la xénophobie - Année 2021 (cncdh.fr)
    ${ }^{21}$ Les néonazis dans l'armée française | Mediapart
    ${ }^{22}$ Maxime Bellamy, freefighter néonazi, hooligan et militaire français | StreetPress

[^5]:    ${ }^{23}$ Enquête ouverte pour des appels à la violence contre les Asiatiques (lemonde.fr)
    ${ }^{24}$ See : Simen Wang et al., I'm more afraid of racism than of the virus!': racism awareness and resistance among Chinese migrants and their descendants in France during the Covid-19 pandemic: European Societies: Vol 23, No sup1 (tandfonline.com)
    ${ }^{25}$ Caricatures, complot, liste de noms : le coronavirus engendre des attaques antisémites sur le web (radiofrance.fr)
    ${ }^{26}$ Gharbi, Buzyn, Macron, Hirsch : la photo qui tue (la santé publique) - Egalite et Réconciliation (egaliteetreconciliation.fr)
    ${ }^{27}$ See the poster and names here: Pancarte antisémite. Cassandre Fristot condamnée à 6 mois de prison avec sursis - Licra - Antiraciste depuis 1927
    ${ }^{28}$ Civitas, de l'intégrisme chrétien à l'opposition au passe sanitaire (lemonde.fr)
    ${ }^{29}$ Civitas N ${ }^{\circ} 80$ - Great Reset, Presse, Médias, Nos Rayons - Chiré (chire.fr)
    ${ }^{30}$ Gérald Bronner : «La théorie du complot va dans le sens des intuitions du cerveau » - Public Sénat (publicsenat.fr)

[^6]:    ${ }^{52} 2022$ : restaurer le politique. Identité, souveraineté, sacré | Institut lliade (institut-iliade.com)
    ${ }^{53}$ Ukraine : revenus avec des armes de guerre, deux militants d'ultradroite condamnés | TF1 INFO
    ${ }^{54}$ Foot français : la menace hooligans- L'Équipe explore (lequipe.fr)
    ${ }^{55}$ L'ultradroite se manifeste violemment en marge de France-Maroc, la gauche dénonce des «ratonnades » (ouest-france.fr)
    ${ }^{56}$ Violences après le match France-Maroc : le procès de sept proches de l'ultradroite s'ouvre à Paris (france24.com) ${ }^{57} 41$ attentats islamistes ont été déjoués depuis 2017 selon Gérald Darmanin (lejdd.fr)

[^7]:    ${ }^{58} \mathrm{https}: / / w w w . t f 1 i n f o . f r / s o c i e t e / s e p a r a t i s m e-836$-etablissements-fermes-et-pres-de-800-etrangers-radicalises-expulses-selon-gerald-darmanin-2235446.html
    ${ }^{59}$ https://www.liberation.fr/checknews/que-sait-on-des-718-etablissements-fermes-pour-separatisme-depuis-le-debut-du-quinquennat-20220421_JRBNA4Z4NFCZDD4ZCB7SEWKMRQ/

[^8]:    ${ }^{64}$ The novelist Renaud Camus coined the word Great Replacement in a 2010 book, «Le Grand remplacement »), which is used mainly by the Identitarian Extreme-Right but also by Eric Zemmour and his party, Reconquête.
    ${ }^{65}$ https://www.lefigaro.fr/politique/francocide-eric-zemmour-dit-s-etre-inspire-de-la-definition-des-feminicides-pour-formuler-ce-terme-20221020
    ${ }^{66}$ https://www.midilibre.fr/2022/10/20/attaque-de-sos-mediterranee-a-marseille-jusqua-un-an-de-prison-ferme-contre-les-membres-de-generation-identitaire-10750775.php
    ${ }^{6767}$ https://www.midilibre.fr/2022/10/10/covid-lantivax-denis-agret-condamne-a-montpellier-a-six-mois-de-prison-avec-sursis-pour-menaces-de-mort-10726240.php and https://www.nouvelobs.com/coronavirus-de-wuhan/20210921.OBS48898/on-va-te-mettre-une-balle-ces-medecins-menaces-de-mort-par-les-antivax.html ${ }^{68}$ https://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/paris-ile-de-france/paris/zouaves-paris-peines-confirmees-en-appel-pour-l-attaque-d-un-bar-antifa-a-paris-2743670.html
    ${ }^{69}$ https://www.tf1info.fr/politique/marine-le-pen-du-rassemblement-national-rn-demande-a-elisabeth-borne-de-dissoudre-les-groupuscules-extremistes-apres-ratonnades-racistes-en-marge-de-coupe-du-monde-2022-
    2242549.html
    ${ }^{70}$ https://www.leparisien.fr/politique/doigt-dhonneur-de-zemmour-eric-ciotti-demande-la-dissolution-des-antifas-30-11-2021-2U7FFQNDRRCN7E7FUB34K4XXXE.php

[^9]:    ${ }^{71}$ https://www.blast-info.fr/articles/2022/agressions-provocations-homophobie-les-partisans-de-zemmour-se-lachent-xIm4elkoTW6ljlrXcxXCIg
    ${ }^{72}$ https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/article_Ic/LEGIARTIO00033975343?init=true\&page=1\&query=13277\&searchField=ALL\&tab_selection=all
    https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_Ic/LEGITEXT000006070719/LEGISCTA000006165269/\#LEGISCTA000 006165269
    ${ }^{74}$ https://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2023/06/10/au-chevet-des-victimes-de-l-attaque-au-couteau-d-annecy-emmanuel-macron-evoque-la-pire-barbarie-qui-soit_6176991_823448.html
    ${ }^{75}$ https://www.lemonde.fr/societe/article/2023/06/10/attaque-au-couteau-a-annecy-abdelmasih-h-mis-en-examen-pour-tentatives-d-assassinats_6177053_3224.html

